

Part 1

**Scotland-focused analysis of statistical data on participation in
apprenticeships in four UK countries**

Dr Filip Sosenko

Dr Gina Netto

Heriot-Watt University, Edinburgh

July 2013



Contents

Executive Summary	2
1. Introduction and Background.....	6
1.1 Introduction	6
1.2 The UK context	6
1.3 Underrepresentation in apprenticeships	8
1.4 Apprenticeship systems in four UK countries.....	10
1.5 Overview of trends in apprenticeship starts.....	12
1.6 Overview of apprenticeship starts by level	14
2. Trends in participation by gender	17
2.1 Trends in participation by gender and sector framework	21
2.2 Trends in participation by gender and type of programme (level)	31
3. Trends in participation by age.....	35
3.1 Starts by age group	36
3.2 Level by age group	42
4. Trends in participation by ethnicity.....	46
5. Trends in participation by Learning Difficulty and/or Disability (LDD)	52
6. Trends in participation by faith/belief	57
7. Gaps in data	59
8. Conclusion	61
9. References.....	64

Executive Summary

Introduction

Modern Apprenticeships provide opportunities for apprentices and employers to reap enormous benefits and to fill skills shortages, supporting economic growth. Since 1995, Modern Apprenticeships have been a major government-funded programme which provides routes into employment in England, Wales and Northern Ireland. In Scotland, as employed status is mandatory within the MA framework, the individual must be employed prior to commencing their apprenticeship. This includes both new recruits as well as those who have been in employment for some time. The programme's significance has been testified by the fact that it has survived cuts in funding in the current recessionary period in England, Wales and Northern Ireland. In Scotland, there are different funding arrangements, with the public sector making only a small contribution towards the overall costs. The aim of this study was to examine the take-up of these opportunities by equality groups, the levels at which such groups are represented, the sectors or frameworks in which they work and the investment per individual on the basis of quantitative data. The focus of the study is Scotland, with comparative analysis of the other UK countries.

Main Findings

Analysis of available data on apprenticeships in Scotland in terms of gender, ethnicity and disability/learning difficulty revealed that such programmes reflect existing inequalities in labour market participation. Gender disaggregated data reveals inequalities in terms of occupational segregation, the number of apprentices, programme levels and investment per individual. Ethnicity disaggregated data reveals under-representation in terms of the number of apprentices and more highly valued programme levels which can lead onto higher education and professional status. Data on individuals with Learning Difficulties and/or Disabilities (LDD) reveals that low numbers of people with a disability or learning difficulty are starting apprenticeships. Further, reflecting labour market disadvantage on more than on dimension of inequality, male

individuals with LDD tend to benefit more from apprenticeships than their female counterparts.

Scotland's progress in terms of redressing current gender inequalities through Modern Apprenticeships relative to England, Wales and Northern Ireland is mixed. Compared to the other three countries, Scotland is the only country in which the number of female starts is persistently lower than male starts; other countries have succeeded in correcting previous trends of female under-representation in terms of starts. It is also the UK country with the highest proportion of under 20 year olds. Its levels of investment in Modern Apprenticeships are worryingly gendered in favour of men, and it fares worse in terms of addressing gender inequality in programme levels. However, occupational segregation by gender is slightly less pronounced in the most popular sector frameworks in Scotland than in England and Wales.

In addition, Scotland's investment in apprenticeships is highly gendered, with average spend per male apprentice being 53% higher than the average spend per female apprentice. This can be explained by the heavy dominance of men in eleven out of twelve 'top-spend' frameworks. With the exception of Early Years care and Education the levels of spend in female-dominated frameworks is typically low.

Compounding the picture of gender disadvantage, in Scotland opportunities to take up training while being employed in female-dominated frameworks tend to be at Level 2 rather than Level 3, with the opposite situation in male-dominated frameworks. The growth in the numbers of female starts is concentrated in female-dominated service and care sector jobs, which does not augur well for narrowing the pay gap in the near future. It is perhaps not surprising that patterns of entry to apprenticeships mirror those seen in employment, given that role models, stereotypes and occupational gender segregation as well as employer recruitment decisions all exert an influence on young people's career choices. However, it is encouraging to note that women are not being disadvantaged within frameworks; that is within the same sector framework, there is no evidence that more women are starting at Level 2, while more men are starting at Level 3.

In terms of age, it is worth noting a huge rise in apprenticeship starts for applicants aged 25+ in England since 2006/07. However, it is Northern Ireland which has the highest proportion of 25+ apprentice starts (at 56%). England and Wales are similar on the proportion of applicants aged 25+ starting apprenticeship, at 44% and 47% respectively in 2011/12. Wales was the first country where those aged 25+ became the largest group (in 2008/09). Data relating to apprentices aged above 25 in Scotland is not available. Comparing the take-up of apprenticeships among 16-19 year olds in Scotland with the same age group in Wales and Northern Ireland, Scotland has significantly more apprentices starting at 16-19 than Wales and NI.

In terms of entry level by age, 16-19 and 20+ age groups in Scotland are more likely to start at Level 3+ while all three age groups in England (16-18; 19-24; 25+) and Wales (16-19; 20-24; 25+) are more likely to start at Level 2.

Minority ethnic groups are underrepresented in Scotland but the scale of this underrepresentation is currently difficult to determine (a more precise analysis will be possible when Census 2011 results for age by ethnicity are published). Further, unlike White apprentices, non-White apprentices constitute a higher proportion of relatively less valuable Level 2 starts than Level 3+ starts in Scotland. Non-White groups are also highly underrepresented in England and Wales. English data on applications also shows that non-White applicants are less successful in obtaining apprenticeships than White applicants.

Underrepresentation of individuals with LDD in apprenticeships in Scotland has been very high and persistent. Furthermore, the participation rate for this group has been falling. None of the UK countries are doing well in this area, with England performing the least badly. Female individuals with LDD are more underrepresented in Scotland than males with a disability/LD. Unlike fully-abled apprentices, apprentices with LDD constitute a higher proportion of relatively less valuable Level 2 starts than Level 3+ starts in Scotland.

Data on faith/belief is only available for Northern Ireland. While the analysis of NI data is difficult, it seems that Catholics are fairly represented in apprenticeships.

None of the UK countries collects data on sexual orientation of apprentices.

Conclusion

The increased number of people participating in apprenticeships indicates the value of the programme to employers and apprentices. However, substantial progress remains to be made in terms of equality proofing apprenticeships to ensure that current inequalities are corrected, to promote a more diverse workforce and to support economic growth. This applies to recruitment of new apprenticeships, investment per individual and representation in occupational frameworks.

Recommendations

Scottish Government should adopt a strategic approach to Modern Apprenticeships which seeks to:

- Increase the diversity of individuals participating in apprenticeships among the population, including among women, ethnic minorities and people with a disability or learning difficulty
- Widen the range of industries, sectors and organisations in which the three equality groups are represented
- In order to achieve this, Scottish Government/Skills Development Scotland should remind public sector organisations which are participating in the programme of their duties under the Equalities and Human Rights Act to promote a diverse workforce, including by collecting and reviewing equality data on those participating in apprenticeship programmes, and taking appropriate action.
- Scottish Government/Skills Development Scotland should encourage private sector employers who are participating in the programme to collect and review equality data relating to those participating in the apprenticeship programmes
- Where apprenticeships are advertised (as in the case of the Commonwealth Apprenticeship Initiative), the SG should encourage employers to increase the diversity of recruits through positive action. This could take a form of targeted action to publicise apprenticeships, for instance through outreach work in areas densely populated by ethnic minorities

Employers can take positive action to promote more diverse workforces by:

- Encouraging women to take up apprenticeships in non-traditional activities, for instance through supporting family friendly policies
- By working with community organisations to encourage other equality groups to take up apprenticeships

1. Introduction and Background

1.1 Introduction

An Apprenticeship is a paid job combined with training, ending with recognised qualifications. As an alternative to Further Education, it constitutes an entry point into the labour market for a significant number of young people. As a tool to increase skills level, productivity and economic performance apprenticeships are beneficial to the wider economy. The potential returns for apprentices include improved probability of employment, higher earnings over the lifetime, sustainable employment and occupational mobility (IER, 2012). Returns for employers include productivity gains stemming from employees having the 'right' skills and embracing company values, improved labour supply, increased efficiency in terms of recruitment and retention, and reduced costs (IER, 2012). Apprenticeships also help employers to redress an ageing workforce.

1.2 The UK context

In the UK in the past apprenticeships were mainly available in male-dominated craft and engineering trades and occupations. Due to deindustrialisation of the British economy, by 1990 the number of apprentices dropped to one-fifth of what it used to be in the 1960s (Campbell, Thomson, & Pautz, 2011). The state did not have a role in funding or promoting apprenticeships until 1995 when the UK Government created publicly-funded Modern Apprenticeships to counter the decline of numbers and increase the supply of intermediate skills (which was lower than in competitor countries; Unwin & Wellington, 2001). An integral part of the programme was to expand apprenticeships

into all sectors of the economy and to combat occupational segregation. MAs proved to be effective in arresting the decline in participation.

Currently Apprenticeships are the key Government programme for vocational education and training, and form a central component of the Government's strategies for social mobility and up-skilling the workforce (Newton, Miller, Oakley, & Hicks, 2012). Apprenticeship training retained high levels of funding despite the recession and effectively survived recent spending reviews in England, Wales and Northern Ireland (BIS, 2010). In Scotland, there are different funding arrangements, with the public sector providing contribution towards the costs of training and assessment.

While most of the training is 'on the job' within the workplace, the rest can be provided by a local college or by a specialist learning provider. In some cases it could all be undertaken by the employer. In the past demand for apprenticeships was employer-driven but, in England, Wales and Northern Ireland, it is now the training providers who seek out apprenticeship places (Campbell et al., 2011). In contrast, in Scotland, individuals need to be employed before they can become apprentices.

Successful completion of MAs requires attainment of nationally recognised qualifications, such as NVQ2 or NVQ3 in England. In England the cost of training is subsidised by the government: up to 100% for ages 16-18 and up to 50% for 19-24 year olds (with the remaining amount provided by the employer).

All employed apprentices get a wage. The 'apprentice National Minimum Wage' is currently £2.65 per hour in all UK countries. The apprentice 'National Minimum Wage' applies to all 16 to 18 year olds and to those aged 19 and over in the first year of their Apprenticeship; those who reach age 19 and have completed the first year of their Apprenticeship are paid at least the 'full National Minimum Wage' rate for those aged 18 to 20.

1.3 Underrepresentation in apprenticeships

Overview:

Equal participation in MAs provides an excellent opportunity to further equal participation in the labour market and reduce persistent levels of poverty experienced by certain equalities groups. However, low levels of participation of people from equalities groups in apprenticeship programmes present a serious challenge to this opportunity. The EOC investigation from 2003 found that MAs mirrored the gender segregation of jobs in the wider labour market and perpetuated gender segregation (Fuller, Beck, & Unwin, 2005; Miller, 2005; Thomson, McKay, Campbell, & Gillespie, 2005). Further research by Beck et al. (2006) revealed issues with regards to race, while the Equality Impact Assessment carried out by Skills Development Scotland in 2010 recognised ‘the continuing low participation rates of the three equalities groups in all National Training Programmes’ (Robertson, 2010). The EHRC’s own review found ‘little change’ with regards to gender and disability and a small increase in BME participation in MAs (Fuller & Davey, 2010). In England the proportion of apprentices declaring learning difficulty/disability fell significantly between 2005 and 2011 (Little, 2012). The persistence of gender segregation issues has been very recently re-stated in research by WiSE (2013, “Analysis of the Modern Apprenticeship Programme in Scotland”).

Occupational segregation:

In the UK, the post-1995 expansion into non-traditional sectors led to a rise in the number of female apprentices. However, it has also replicated traditional patterns of gender segregation in the labour market where men dominate the ‘traditional’ apprenticeships in craft, technical and engineering occupations, while women dominate the mainly service or care sector occupations (Campbell et al., 2011). It needs to be stated that the UK is not an exception here as occupational segregation is characteristic of all modern labour markets and apprenticeship programmes around the world, As Miller observes, it is perhaps not surprising that patterns of entry to apprenticeships mirror those seen in employment, given that role models, stereotypes and occupational

gender segregation all exert an influence on young people's career choices (Miller, 2005).

Occupational segregation has a damaging effect on the economy as it contributes to the continuing skills deficit in the UK (Campbell et al., 2011) through failing to make the most efficient use of the potential workforce. Skills shortages often occur in sectors with least female participation (Fuller et al., 2005). In Scotland the sectors with the highest numbers of hard-to-fill and skill shortage vacancies are those within the skilled trades occupation, including construction, engineering and plumbing, with research carried out as part of the current study confirming earlier research on skills shortages (Thomson et al., 2005). Increasing the numbers of women entering these sectors would increase the pool of skilled labour on which such sectors can draw.

Furthermore, gender-based occupational segregation remains a key cause of the gender pay gap (Campbell et al., 2011): occupations which are classed as "women's work" attract lower pay and status than those perceived as "male". This is mirrored in MAs where female apprentices as a group earn significantly less than male apprentices (Campbell et al., 2011).

Apart from wages, there is evidence that apprenticeships offer far less for women in terms of length of training (Campbell et al., 2011). Female-dominated frameworks such as hairdressing tend to be short-term while male-dominated ones such as construction last up to four years.

Similarly, female dominated service sector jobs that tend to be at Level 2, rather than male-dominated craft, technical and engineering opportunities that are more likely to be available at Level 3 (Fuller et al., 2005). Importantly, Level 3 occupations lead to qualifications which are acceptable for entry to higher education and to pathways leading to professional status (Fuller et al., 2005).

It has been argued that training programmes in general and apprenticeships in particular have an important role to play in helping to break the cycle of occupational segregation that results in 'women's jobs' being low paid (Campbell et al., 2011). As it stands, however, several studies have found that apprenticeships not only mirror gender

inequalities in the wider labour market, but also actively reinforce them by prioritising job creation for men (Campbell et al., 2011).

In England, the commitment of the NAS to promoting diversity and challenging occupational segregation (NAS, 2009) presents an opportunity to desegregate the apprenticeship system in the UK for the benefit of female apprentices and the wider economy (Campbell et al., 2011). For Scotland, addressing gender segregation in MAs would help the Scottish Government achieve its National Outcomes on narrowing the pay gap and – as an indirect result - eradicating child poverty.

Underrepresentation of minority ethnic groups:

Equal representation would have benefits for BME individuals and for employers. With regards to the latter, skills shortages often occur in sectors with few BME (see Part 2). As for BME individuals, increased participation in MAs would help alleviate BME youth unemployment which is worse than for White youth (Netto, Sosenko, & Bramley, 2011). It would also help narrow the pay gap between BME and White workers.

1.4 Apprenticeship systems in four UK countries¹

Education and training, including apprenticeships, are devolved matters. They all, however, largely follow a ‘framework’ structure that sets out the requirements of each level of apprenticeship, developed in part by Sector Skills Councils.

Scotland

As in the rest of the UK, Modern Apprenticeships (MAs) were introduced in 1995 for those aged 16-24 in employment, providing work-based training combined with study for a SVQ Level 3 or Level 4 qualification. Until 2008/09, Scotland has only been offering a Level 3 Apprenticeship. Level 2 apprenticeships were approved for delivery from 2009.

There are currently four levels of apprenticeship in Scotland²:

- Modern Apprenticeships at SCQF Level 5 (Level 2)
- Modern Apprenticeships at SCQF Level 6/7 (Level 3)
- Technical Apprenticeships at SCQF Level 8/9 (Level 4)

¹ Information in this section is mostly derived from O’Toole (2011).

² <http://www.skillsdevelopmentscotland.co.uk/our-services/modern-apprenticeships/modern-apprenticeship-group/guidance-for-sector-skills-councils/>

- Professional Apprenticeships at SCQF Level 10+ (Level 5).

England

Three levels of apprenticeship are available in England. These are:

Intermediate Level Apprenticeships - Intermediate apprentices work towards work-based learning qualifications such as an NVQ Level 2, Key Skills and, in some cases, a relevant knowledge-based qualification such as a BTEC. These provide the skills needed for a chosen career and allow entry to an Advanced Level Apprenticeship.

Advanced Level Apprenticeships - Advanced level apprentices work towards work-based learning qualifications such as NVQ Level 3, Key Skills and, in most cases, a relevant knowledge-based certificate such as a BTEC. To start this programme, candidates should ideally have five GCSEs (grade C or above) or have completed an Intermediate Level Apprenticeship.

Higher Apprenticeships - Higher Apprenticeships work towards work-based learning qualifications such as NVQ Level 4 and, in some cases, a knowledge-based qualification such as a foundation degree.

The National Apprenticeship Service (NAS) supports, funds and coordinates the delivery of Apprenticeships throughout England.

The *Education and Skills Act 2008* increased the minimum age at which young people in England can leave learning, requiring them to continue in education or training to the age of 17 from 2013 and to 18 from 2015. Young people who are currently leaving school or college at 16 or 17 and are entering jobs will, in future, be required to participate in some form of government supported education or training programme. This combined with the fact that in the Apprenticeship Act 2009 the Westminster Government committed itself to give all suitably qualified young people the right to apprenticeship training by 2013 (Campbell et al., 2011) means that the numbers of applicants aged 16 to 18 seeking apprenticeships is likely to expand.

With regards to groups underrepresented in MAs, on the positive side NAS has committed itself to addressing underrepresentation (NAS 2009) and conducted pilot projects aimed at identifying barriers and solutions

(Newton et al., 2012). Disappointingly however, the Richard Review of Apprenticeships in England does not mention underrepresentation at all (Richard, 2012).

Wales

There are three levels of apprenticeship available for those aged 16 and over in Wales: Foundation Apprenticeships (equivalent to five good GCSE passes), Apprenticeship (equivalent to two A-level passes) and Higher Apprenticeships.

For a **Foundation Apprenticeship**, apprentices work towards work-based learning qualifications such as an NVQ Level 2, Key Skills and, in some cases, a relevant knowledge-based qualification such as a BTEC.

For an **Apprenticeship**, apprentices work towards work-based learning qualifications such as NVQ Level 3, Key Skills and, in most cases, a relevant knowledge based certificate such as a BTEC. To start this programme, apprentices 'should ideally have five GCSEs (grade C or above) or have completed a Foundation Apprenticeship'.

Higher Apprenticeships work towards work-based learning qualifications such as NVQ Level 4 and, in some cases, a knowledge-based qualification such as a foundation degree.

Northern Ireland

Until 2006/07, all apprenticeships in Northern Ireland were Level 3. In 2007, Level 2 Apprenticeships were introduced for the first time; and the following year (2008), All Age Apprenticeships [25+] were introduced for the first time.

1.5 Overview of trends in apprenticeship starts

Looking at the overall number of apprenticeship starts (Table 1.1), Scotland saw a downward trend between 2004/05-2008/09 followed by an upward trend from 2009/10, to record 26,427 apprenticeship starts in 2011/12. However, most of the growth since 2009/10 came from the incorporation of Level 2 in MAs. As we will see in section 1.6 below,

Scotland had fewer Level 3+ apprentices in 2011/12 than around 2003-2005.

In England the numbers of starts were stable between 2002/03-2006/07 followed by an upward trend, with numbers doubling between 2009/10 and 2011/12. No clear trend could be observed for Wales, with numbers going up and down in the last four years (no data is readily available for previous years). In Northern Ireland, there was a strong upward trend post 2006/07 (linked but not limited to the incorporation of Level 2 in MAs from 2007/08). Despite a decrease in the number of starts in 2011/12 the latest available figures are 50% higher than 2007/08.

Overall, data shows that apprenticeships starts have increased significantly in England and NI but not in Scotland and Wales. Seen in relation to the total population, Scotland visibly lags behind England as England has 1 apprentice per 100 population, Wales has 1 in 168, Scotland has 1 in 200, and NI 1 in 214.

Despite England being the leader in numerical terms, further demand for apprenticeship places can still be expected there as the participation age in England is rising to 17 in 2013 and 18 in 2015. The introduction of tuition fees in England may also contribute to some young people choosing apprenticeships over Higher Education. On the negative side, the demand from applicants aged 24+ may be hindered by the introduction of fees for this age group from 2013/14 at Level 3+.

Table 1.1

Numbers of apprenticeship starts by country of the UK

	2002/03	2003/04	2004/05	2005/06	2006/07	2007/08	2008/09	2009/10	2010/11	2011/12
Scotland	N/A	N/A	N/A	20,196	16,913	15,803	10,579	20,216	21,561	26,427
England	167,700	193,600	189,000	175,000	184,400	224,800	239,900	279,700	457,200	520,600
Wales	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	19,110	17,465	19,620	17,910
NI	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	3,297	5,587	7,372	6,973	9,359	8,388

Source: Skills Development Scotland, Skills Funding Agency, Department for Education and Skills, DELNI (personal correspondence)

1.6 Overview of apprenticeship starts by level

Although Scotland managed to significantly increase the number of Level 3+ apprentices between 2008/09 and 2011/12, it still had fewer Level 3+ apprentices in 2011/12 than in 2005/06 (Table 1.2; see Table 1.1 for earlier years). Since the introduction of Level 2 in 2008/09, Scotland had more Level 3+ apprenticeship starts than Level 2 starts. Proportion of Level 2 starts rose from 32.5% in 2009/10 to 42.3% in 2011/12 which seems to be particularly linked to the rise in absolute numbers of 16-19 year olds starting at Level 2 (Table 3.5). However, as

Apprenticeship Level 2 was only introduced in Scotland relatively recently, one has to be cautious with the interpretation of trends.

As we can see in Table 1.3, in England from 1999/2000 there were significantly more Level 2 starts than Level 3+ starts (although the proportion of Level 2 starts has been decreasing in the ten years to 2011/12, which seems to be linked to the rise of apprentices aged 25+ who are more likely to start at Level 3+).

A stable trend can be observed in Wales with more Level 2 starts than Level 3 starts (Table 1.4).

In comparison, Scotland is faring better than England and Wales in that it has more (valuable) Level 3+ apprenticeship starts than Level 2 starts. However, against the total population, the proportion of Level 3 starts in Scotland is slightly lower than in England (0.29 Level 3+ start per 100 population compared to 0.36 for England).

Table 1.2

Numbers of apprenticeship starts by level, Scotland

Level	2008/09	2009/10	2010/11	2011/12
Level 2	N/A	6,578 32.5%	8,827 40.9%	11,166 42.3%
Level 3+	10,579 100.0%	13,638 67.5%	12,734 59.1%	15,261 57.7%

Total	10,579	20,216	21,561	26,427
--------------	--------	--------	--------	--------

Source: Skills Development Scotland (personal correspondence)

Table 1.3

Numbers of apprenticeship starts by level, England*

Level	1999/2000 **	2002/03	2004/05	2006/07	2008/09	2010/11	2011/12
Apprenticeship (level 2)	88,000 53.4%	119,300 71.2%	135,200 71.5%	127,400 69.1%	158,500 66.0%	301,100 65.9%	329,000 63.2%
Advanced Apprenticeship including Higher Level Apprenticeship (level 3+)	76,800 46.6%	48,400 28.9%	53,900 28.5%	57,000 30.9%	81,400 33.9%	156,100 34.1%	191,500 36.8%
Total	164,800	167,600	189,000	184,400	240,000	457,200	520,600

Source: Skills Funding Agency (personal correspondence)

*Data for 2000/01, 2001/02, 2003/04, 2005/06, 2007/08 and 2009/10 are hidden for presentation purposes

** Source: Department for Children, Schools and Families (DfCSF) (2007) Starts on Work Based Learning Provision by Programme Strand, England, 1997/98 to 2006/07

Table 1.4

Numbers of apprenticeship starts by level, Wales

Level	2008/09	2009/10	2010/11	2011/12
Foundation Apprenticeship	11,000 57.5%	9,540 54.6%	11,205 57.1%	10,205 57.0%
Apprenticeship*	8,115 42.5%	7,920 45.4%	8,415 42.9%	7,705 43.0%
Total	19,115	17,460	19,620	17,910

Source: Department for Education and Skills (personal correspondence)

*including Modern Skills Diploma (2008/09-2010/11) and Higher Apprenticeship (2011/12)

2. Trends in participation by gender

A stable trend can be observed for Scotland with around 10-20% more male apprenticeships starts than female starts (Table 2.1). Available data shows that 2008/09 was an unusual year when a significant decrease in female starts was recorded. In contrast, Northern Ireland saw a high rise in female starts at the same time (Table 2.4).

In England, historically there were more male than female starts but this trend was reversed in 2010/11 (Table 2.2). Looking at the big rise in apprenticeship starts post-2010, female starts have a proportionally bigger share than male starts (+137,580 female starts between 2009/10 and 2011/12 compared to +103,330 male starts).

In the period covered by our data (post-2008) we can see more female than male starts in Wales (Table 2.3).

In Northern Ireland there were more male than female starts in the past but a big rise in female starts was recorded in 2008/09 (Table 2.4). Since that year, there has been slightly more female than male starts.

In comparison, Scotland has been bucking the UK trend in recent years as there are now more female than male starts in the three other countries. The trend that can still be observed in Scotland reversed in 2010/11 in England and 2008/09 in Northern Ireland, while Wales already had more female starts by 2008/09.

Table 2.1

Number of apprenticeship starts by gender, Scotland

Gender	2005/06	2006/07	2007/08	2008/09	2009/10	2010/11	2011/12
Female	9,269	6,722	5,753	2,857	8,473	9,656	11,381

	45.9%	39.7%	36.4%	27.0%	41.9%	44.8%	43.1%
Male	10,927 54.1%	10,191 60.3%	10,050 63.6%	7,722 73.0%	11,743 58.1%	11,905 55.2%	15,046 56.9%
Total Starts	20,196	16,913	15,803	10,579	20,216	21,561	26,427

Source: Skills Development Scotland (personal correspondence)

Table 2.2

Number of apprenticeship starts by gender, England

Gender	2002/03	2003/04	2004/05	2005/06	2006/07	2007/08	2008/09	2009/10	2010/11	2011/12
Female	83,150 49.6%	93,240 48.2%	87,700 46.4%	82,540 47.2%	84,420 45.8%	106,550 47.4%	119,250 49.7%	138,640 49.6%	245,990 53.8%	276,220 53.1%
Male	84,540 50.4%	100,320 51.8%	101,330 53.6%	92,440 52.8%	100,010 54.2%	118,210 52.6%	120,700 50.3%	141,030 50.4%	211,220 46.2%	244,360 46.9%
Total starts	167,700	193,600	189,000	175,000	184,400	224,800	239,900	279,700	457,200	520,600

Source: Skills Funding Agency (personal correspondence)

Table 2.3

Number of apprenticeship starts by gender, Wales

Gender	2008/09	2009/10	2010/11	2011/12
Female	10,625 55.6%	10,050 57.5%	11,095 56.5%	10,150 56.7%
Male	8,485 44.4%	7,415 42.5%	8,525 43.5%	7,760 43.3%
Total Starts	19,110	17,465	19,620	17,910

Source: Department for Education and Skills (personal correspondence)

Table 2.4

Number of apprenticeship starts by gender, Northern Ireland

Gender	2006/07	2007/08	2008/09	2009/10	2010/11	2011/12
---------------	----------------	----------------	----------------	----------------	----------------	----------------

Female	1,090 33.1%	1,696 30.4%	4,026 54.6%	3,568 51.2%	5,040 53.9%	4,496 53.6%
Male	2,207 66.9%	3,891 69.6%	3,346 45.4%	3,405 48.8%	4,319 46.1%	3,892 46.4%
Total Starts	3,297	5,587	7,372	6,973	9,359	8,388

Source: DELNI (personal correspondence)

2.1 Trends in participation by gender and sector framework

For this part of the analysis we looked into top frameworks in terms of the total numbers of apprentice starts (500 in Scotland/Wales/NI; 10,000 in England). As we can see in Table 2.5, in Scotland in 2011/12 eight out of fourteen top frameworks had high occupational segregation (defined for our purposes as 75% or more of all starts coming from one gender). However, we were able to detect positive trends in three of these eight frameworks (Health & Social Care, Business & Administration, Driving Goods Vehicles) where occupational segregation slightly dropped between 2008/09 and 2011/12.

In practice, male apprentices are present in a wider range of frameworks. Choosing for our purposes the level of a minimum one in five apprentices coming from a given gender as an indicator of a particular framework or career being perceived by that gender as appealing, 62 out of all 68 frameworks which attracted new

apprentices in 2011/12 were perceived as appealing by male applicants. For new female apprentices the number was much smaller at 26 out of 68. The perceived choice for females has actually slightly worsened since 2008/09 and improved for men: in that year 28 out of 66 frameworks were perceived as attractive by new female apprentices while the number for new male apprentices was 53 out of 66 frameworks.

In the light of such data it is unsurprising that the growth in female starts between 2009/10 and 2011/12 was more concentrated than the growth in male starts. 73% of all growth in female starts concentrated in three frameworks: Hospitality, Business & Administration, and Hairdressing while the growth in male starts was more spread in the same period with 54% of it concentrated in three frameworks: Automotive, Electrotechnical and Management. Such trends indicate the need for more effort in redressing current patterns of occupational segregation.

In England, nine out of thirteen top frameworks had high occupational segregation (75% and above of one gender) in 2011/12 (Table 2.10). In six of these thirteen top frameworks positive trends could be detected, revealing slight falls in gender segregation between 2008/09 and 2011/12 (although it was still very high in some cases).

Similarly to Scotland, male applicants in England in practice are present in a wider range of frameworks. Again choosing the level of minimum one in five apprentices coming from a given gender as an indicator of a particular framework being perceived as appealing by that gender, 107 out of all 121 frameworks which attracted new apprentices in 2011/12 were perceived as appealing by new male apprentices. For new female apprentices the number was much smaller at 60 out of 121. The range of frameworks or careers attracting apprentices of both genders has slightly widened since 2008/09 when only 50 out of 109 frameworks were perceived as attractive by new female apprentices while the number for new male apprentices was 92 out of the same number of frameworks.

A further analysis has revealed that the huge rise in female starts in Health and Social Care between 2009/10 and 2011/12 (+43,000) is the main factor responsible for the fact that in the three years up to 2011/12 there were more female than male apprenticeship starts in England. The further two top frameworks - Customer Service and Management - gained additional 18,100 and 20,220 female starts respectively in the same period. This means that 61% of growth in female starts between 2009/10 and 2011/12 was concentrated in three frameworks. The growth in male starts was more spread with 40% of it concentrated in three frameworks (the highest growth was in Industrial Applications, with an additional 15,410 male starts in the same period).

These trends show that although the female proportion of MA cohort is rising, it is doing so as a result of the growth of female dominated service sector jobs³, which does not hold promise of closing the pay gap in the future. It is worth noting that Construction and Engineering have remained in the top ten frameworks in Scotland but not in England. Campbell et al (2011) observe that participation in these frameworks experienced a decline due to the post-2007 recession.

In Wales, twelve out of seventeen top frameworks had high occupational segregation (75% and above of one gender) in 2011/12 (Table 2.11). In five of the top frameworks (Health & Social Care; Customer Service; Management (MA); Business Administration) positive trends could be detected; with gender segregation slightly dropping in the years preceding 2011/12 (although it was still very high in some cases). As there was very little growth in the number of starts between 2009/10 and 2011/12, we did not conduct an analysis of growth by gender by sector.

³ It is worth noting that according to Campbell et al (2011) it is unlikely that the growth in apprenticeships in the female dominated health, public service and care sector will continue into the future. This is due to current and forthcoming cuts on public services.

The comparison is positive for Scotland as fewer top frameworks had high occupational segregation in 2011/12 north of the border than in England and Wales. Where trends could be detected, occupational segregation was constant or had slightly dropped in all four countries.

An analysis of patterns in spend by sector framework in Scotland revealed that the country’s investment in apprenticeships is highly gendered: the average spend per male apprentice is 53% higher than an average spend per female apprentice (£3,227 compared with £2,115; figures for 2011/12). As can be seen in Table 2.7, eleven out of twelve ‘top-spend’ frameworks are very heavily male-dominated. Table 2.6 presents the levels of spend in the most popular frameworks, showing that the levels of spend in female-dominated frameworks is typically low (with the exception of Early Years care and Education).

Recent evidence supports the claim that women are disadvantaged when it comes to the ‘quality’ of apprenticeships. Female-dominated frameworks or careers tend to be ones in which opportunities to become apprentices are available at Level 2 rather than Level 3, with the opposite situation in male-dominated frameworks (Table 2.8). We have not found evidence of women being disadvantaged within frameworks (i.e. more women starting at Level 2 and more men starting at Level 3 within the same sector framework; Table 2.9).

Table 2.5

Number of apprenticeship starts by framework and gender, Scotland

(Ordered by 2011/12 total figures, minimum 500 apprentices, descending)

Framework	2008/09			2009/10			2010/11			2011/12			
	Male	Female	% Female	Male	Female	% Female	Male	Female	% Female	Male	Female	Total	% Female

Hospitality	158	179	53.1%	976	1,042	51.6%	1,137	1,374	54.7%	1,520	2,000	3,520	56.8%
Construction	2,328	38	1.6%	2,190	41	1.8%	2,015	31	1.5%	2,342	31	2,373	1.3%
Retail	84	183	68.5%	983	999	50.4%	660	1,139	63.3%	785	1,167	1,952	59.8%
Health and Social Care	9	66	88.0%	304	2,035	87.0%	224	1,090	83.0%	300	1,626	1,926	84.4%
Business & Administration Management	158	815	83.8%	183	725	79.8%	423	1,308	75.6%	461	1,336	1,797	74.3%
Customer Service	32	19	37.3%	473	445	48.5%	669	581	46.5%	934	769	1,703	45.2%
Food Manufacture	152	306	66.8%	913	1,105	54.8%	1,085	1,169	51.9%	609	856	1,465	58.4%
Engineering	8	0	0.0%	454	144	24.1%	416	212	33.8%	839	469	1,308	35.9%
Early Years Care and Education	1,312	28	2.1%	1,004	34	3.3%	916	27	2.9%	1,178	31	1,209	2.6%
Hairdressing	5	645	99.2%	17	925	98.2%	33	960	96.7%	37	1,128	1,165	96.8%
Driving Goods Vehicles	11	227	95.4%	30	517	94.5%	111	1,229	91.7%	85	1,072	1,157	92.7%
Automotive	37	2	5.1%	1,223	10	0.8%	675	6	0.9%	1,070	75	1,145	6.6%
Electrotechnical Services	0	0		0	0		0	0		840	10	850	1.2%
	0	0		0	0		447	4	0.9%	496	5	501	1.0%

Source: Skills Development Scotland (personal correspondence)

Table 2.6

Spend in top frameworks by gender, Scotland 2011/12

(Ordered by total number of apprentices, minimum 1,000 apprentices, descending)

Sector Framework	2011/12		
	Total	% Female	Spend per person
Hospitality	3,520	56.8%	£1,895
Construction	2,373	1.3%	£4,795
Retail	1,952	59.8%	£1,713

Health and Social Care	1,926	84.4%	£1,261
Business & Administration Management	1,797	74.3%	£2,716
Customer Service	1,703	45.2%	£1,690
Food Manufacture	1,465	58.4%	£1,033
Engineering	1,308	35.9%	£1,276
Early Years Care and Education	1,209	2.6%	£6,282
Hairdressing	1,165	96.8%	£4,092
Driving Goods Vehicles	1,157	92.7%	£2,500
	1,145	6.6%	£2,329

Source: Skills Development Scotland (personal correspondence)

Table 2.7

Top 12 frameworks by spend per person, Scotland 2011/12

(Ordered by average spend per person, minimum 75 apprentices, descending)

Sector Framework	2011/12		
	Total	% Female	Spend per person
Vehicle Maintenance and Repair	166	3.0%	£22,395
Plumbing	331	1.8%	£8,993
Electrotechnical Services	501	1.0%	£7,537
Heating, Ventilation, Air Conditioning and Refrigeration	88	0.0%	£7,531

Achieving Excellence in Sports Performance (Football)	138	0.0%	£6,320
Engineering	1,209	2.6%	£6,282
Engineering Construction	111	5.4%	£5,230
Construction	2,373	1.3%	£4,795
Early Years Care and Education	1,165	96.8%	£4,092
Oil and Gas Extraction	115	4.3%	£4,059
Extractive and Mineral Processing	77	2.6%	£4,008
Amenity Horticulture	161	1.9%	£3,796

Source: Skills Development Scotland (personal correspondence)

Table 2.8

Starts by level and gender - comparison between frameworks, Scotland

Framework	2011/12			
	Total	% Female	% at Level 2	% at Level 3+
Hospitality	3,520	56.8%	58.7%	41.3%
Construction	2,373	1.3%	22.3%	77.7%
Retail	1,952	59.8%	85.6%	14.4%
Health and Social Care	1,926	84.4%	68.7%	31.3%
Business & Administration	1,797	74.3%	50.2%	49.8%
Management	1,703	45.2%	0.0%	100.0%
Customer Service	1,465	58.4%	34.5%	65.5%

Food Manufacture	1,308	35.9%	91.1%	8.9%
Engineering	1,209	2.6%	0.0%	100.0%
Early Years Care and Education	1,165	96.8%	0.0%	100.0%
Hairdressing	1,157	92.7%	87.0%	13.0%
Driving Goods Vehicles	1,145	6.6%	34.1%	65.9%
Automotive	850	1.2%	8.2%	91.8%
Electrotechnical Services	501	1.0%	0.0%	100.0%

Source: Skills Development Scotland (personal correspondence)

Table 2.9

Starts by level and gender - comparison within frameworks, Scotland

Framework	2011/12			
	Total	% Female	% Female at Level 2	% Female at Level 3+
Hospitality	3,520	56.8%	56.9%	56.7%
Construction	2,373	1.3%	0.0%	1.7%
Retail	1,952	59.8%	59.2%	63.5%
Health and Social Care	1,926	84.4%	85.2%	82.7%
Business &	1,797	74.3%	72.2%	76.5%

Administration Management	1,703	45.2%	N/A	45.2%
Customer Service	1,465	58.4%	60.1%	57.6%
Food Manufacture	1,308	35.9%	35.5%	39.3%
Engineering	1,209	2.6%	N/A	2.6%
Early Years Care and Education	1,165	96.8%	N/A	96.8%
Hairdressing	1,157	92.7%	92.5%	94.0%
Driving Goods Vehicles	1,145	6.6%	15.9%	1.7%
Automotive	850	1.2%	0.0%	1.3%
Electrotechnical Services	501	1.0%	N/A	1.0%

Source: Skills Development Scotland (personal correspondence)

Table 2.10

Apprenticeship Programme Starts by Sector Framework Code and Gender, England

(Ordered by 2011/12 total figures, minimum 10,000 apprentices, descending)

Sector Framework	2008/09			2009/10			2010/11			2011/12			
	Male	Female	% Female	Male	Female	% Female	Male	Female	% Female	Male	Female	Total	% Female
Health and Social Care	1,670	10,600	86.4%	2,680	15,200	85.0%	9,400	44,320	82.5%	12,220	58,600	70,820	82.7%
Customer Service	7,030	15,520	68.8%	10,530	18,880	64.2%	20,590	33,380	61.8%	22,100	36,990	59,090	62.6%
Management	3,820	6,110	61.5%	3,950	5,860	59.7%	12,040	17,740	59.6%	18,900	26,080	44,980	58.0%
Business Administration	3,990	16,810	80.8%	6,230	20,790	76.9%	9,190	29,710	76.4%	11,060	33,500	44,550	75.2%
Hospitality and Catering	7,720	9,080	54.0%	11,020	10,440	48.6%	14,510	15,300	51.3%	16,670	18,870	35,540	53.1%
Retail	3,700	7,240	66.2%	7,620	9,300	55.0%	13,370	28,030	67.7%	13,490	17,750	31,240	56.8%
Children's Care Learning and Development	520	16,730	97.0%	730	19,380	96.4%	1,680	25,730	93.9%	1,790	24,050	25,840	93.1%
Industrial Applications	1,100	80	6.8%	1,150	80	6.5%	3,200	430	11.8%	16,560	2,240	18,800	11.9%
Hairdressing	1,530	14,620	90.5%	1,440	14,800	91.1%	1,420	15,030	91.4%	1,470	15,130	16,610	91.1%
Learning	4,990	2,750	35.5%	8,270	3,070	27.1%	13,040	4,610	26.1%	11,380	4,270	15,640	27.3%
Construction	16,510	270	1.6%	13,850	220	1.6%	15,360	230	1.5%	13,330	230	13,560	1.7%
Engineering	14,820	430	2.8%	14,520	480	3.2%	17,400	940	5.1%	12,880	400	13,280	3.0%
IT and Telecoms													
Professionals (inc ICT)	4,190	410	8.9%	7,220	860	10.6%	10,650	1,390	11.5%	10,400	1,200	11,600	10.3%

Source: Skills Funding Agency (personal correspondence)

Table 2.11

Numbers of apprenticeship participants by sector and gender, Wales

(Ordered by 2011/12 total figures, minimum 500 apprentices, descending)

Sector Framework	2008/09			2009/10			2010/11			2011/12			
	Male	Female	% Female	Male	Female	% Female	Male	Female	% Female	Male	Female	Total	% Female
Health & Social Care	1,335	6,325	82.6%	1,325	5,750	81.3%	1,460	5,745	79.7%	850	3,010	3,860	78.0%
Customer Service	975	2,695	73.4%	860	2,285	72.7%	905	2,200	70.9%	760	1,765	2,525	69.9%
Management (MA only)	1,450	2,330	61.6%	1,210	2,000	62.3%	1,270	1,915	60.1%	710	1,030	1,740	59.2%
Hairdressing	155	1,625	91.3%	160	1,580	90.8%	165	1,565	90.5%	140	1,565	1,705	91.8%
Early Years Care & Education	80	2,825	97.2%	105	3,185	96.8%	105	3,010	96.6%	40	1,470	1,510	97.4%
Engineering	2,470	130	5.0%	2,320	105	4.3%	2,235	90	3.9%	1,380	45	1,425	3.2%
Business Administration	410	2,385	85.3%	455	2,385	84.0%	575	2,335	80.2%	280	1,085	1,365	79.5%
Management	0	0		0	0		0	0		485	705	1,190	59.2%
Children's Care Learning And Development	0	0		0	0		0	0		40	1,020	1,060	96.2%
Hospitality	905	1,310	59.1%	825	1,125	57.7%	900	1,210	57.3%	420	595	1,015	58.6%
Vehicle Maintenance and Repair	900	15	1.6%	1,000	15	1.5%	1,140	15	1.3%	975	15	990	1.5%
Construction	2,875	35	1.2%	2,675	25	0.9%	2,205	25	1.1%	910	10	920	1.1%
Retail	275	605	68.8%	245	475	66.0%	245	440	64.2%	275	435	710	61.3%
Electrotechnical	1,435	10	0.7%	1,185	10	0.8%	1,120	10	0.9%	695	5	700	0.7%
Plumbing	1,095	30	2.7%	1,040	25	2.3%	1,005	30	2.9%	610	10	620	1.6%
Supporting Teaching and Learning in Schools	0	0		0	0		0	0		60	485	545	89.0%
IT User	705	810	53.5%	560	705	55.7%	525	690	56.8%	230	280	510	54.9%

Source: Department for Education and Skills (personal correspondence)

2.2 Trends in participation by gender and type of programme (level)

In Scotland, males are significantly more likely to start at Level 3+ than females (Table 2.12).

In England, both genders are more likely to start at Level 2 than Level 3+ (Table 2.14). In terms of trends, there have been gradually fewer female starts on Level 2 than Level 3+ falling to 60% of female starts being at Level 2

in 2011/12. No similar meaningful pattern could be seen for male starts. From 2010/11 there were proportionally more female than male starts at Level 3+.

In Wales, both genders are more likely to start at Level 2 than Level 3+ (Table 2.15). This has been a stable trend for both genders since 2008/09 (the earliest year for which the data is available). There were proportionally slightly more female than male starts at Level 3+ in 2011/12.

In comparison, Scotland is unlike England and Wales in that it has significantly more male starts on Level 3+ than on Level 2. This means that more males than females have access to higher level training and the labour market returns associated with these achievements (Fuller et al., 2005).

A further analysis by spend (Scotland data only) revealed that on average, Scotland spends significantly more on Level 3+ apprenticeships than on Level 2 ones (£3,879 compared to £1,283, data for 2011/12 derived from Table 2.13). This benefits men more than women as there are proportionally significantly more men than women at Level 3+.

Table 2.12

Numbers of apprenticeship starts by level and gender, Scotland

Level	2008/09		2009/10		2010/11		2011/12	
	Male	Female	Male	Female	Male	Female	Male	Female

Level 2	N/A	N/A	3,050	3,528	3,812	5,015	5,232	5,934
Row %			46.4%	48.1%	43.2%	56.8%	46.9%	53.1%
Column %			26.0%	41.6%	32.0%	51.9%	34.8%	52.1%
Level 3+	7,717	2,862	8,693	4,945	8,093	4,641	9,814	5,447
Row %	72.9%	27.1%	63.7%	37.9%	63.6%	36.4%	64.3%	35.7%
Column %	100%	100%	74.0%	58.4%	68.0%	48.1%	65.2%	47.9%
Total	7,717	2,862	11,743	8,473	11,905	9,656	15,046	11,381

Source: Skills Development Scotland (personal correspondence)

Table 2.13

Spend by MA Level, Scotland

Sum of Net Spend				
Programme	2008-09	2009-10	2010-11	2011-12
Level 2		£2,073,715	£12,880,738	£14,335,011

		3.9%	18.1%	19.5%
Level 3+	£55,085,229 100.0%	£51,424,935 96.1%	£58,385,534 81.9%	£59,197,409 80.5%
Grand Total	£55,085,229	£53,498,650	£71,266,272	£73,532,421

Source: Skills Development Scotland (personal correspondence)

Table 2.14

Numbers of apprenticeship starts by level and gender, England**

Level	2002/03		2004/05		2006/07		2008/09		2010/11		2011/12	
	Male	Female	Male	Female	Male	Female	Male	Female	Male	Female	Male	Female
Apprenticeship (level 2)	56,100	63,200	69,000	66,200	66,700	60,700	78,200	80,300	143,300	157,800	163,500	165,500
Column %	66.4%	76.1%	68.1%	75.5%	66.7%	71.9%	64.8%	67.3%	67.9%	64.1%	66.9%	59.9%
Advanced Apprenticeship *	28,400	20,000	32,400	21,500	33,300	23,700	42,500	38,900	67,900	88,200	80,800	110,700
Column %	33.6%	24.1%	32.0%	24.5%	33.3%	28.1%	35.2%	32.6%	32.1%	35.9%	33.1%	40.1%
Total	84,500	83,100	101,300	87,700	100,000	84,400	120,700	119,300	211,200	246,000	244,400	276,200

Source: Skills Funding Agency (personal correspondence)

*including Higher Level Apprenticeship (level 3+)

** note some columns have been hidden for presentation purposes

Table 2.15

Numbers of apprenticeship starts by level and gender, Wales

Level	2008/09		2009/10		2010/11		2011/12	
	Male	Female	Male	Female	Male	Female	Male	Female
Foundation Apprenticeship	4,915 57.9%	6,085 57.3%	4,155 56.1%	5,385 53.6%	5,030 59.0%	6,175 55.7%	4,560 58.8%	5,645 55.6%
Apprenticeship*	3,575 42.1%	4,540 42.7%	3,255 43.9%	4,665 46.4%	3,495 41.0%	4,920 44.3%	3,200 41.2%	4,505 44.4%
Total	8,490	10,625	7,410	10,050	8,525	11,095	7,760	10,150

Source: Department for Education and Skills (personal correspondence)

*including Modern Skills Diploma (2008/09 - 2010/11) and Higher Apprenticeship (2011/12)

3. Trends in participation by age

3.1 Starts by age group

No visible patterns in participation by age groups can be seen in Scotland (Table 3.1). In the most recent year for which data is available (2011/12) the two age groups (16-19, 20+) were represented evenly in apprenticeship starts. Unfortunately, any more advanced analysis is hindered by the fact that data for 20+ year olds cannot be disaggregated into 20-24 and 25+ subgroups⁴.

In England, the most striking trend is the huge rise (absolute and proportional) in apprenticeship starts for applicants aged 25+ (Table 3.2). The 25+ age group did not practically exist until 2006/07 but is now by far the most numerous. Interestingly the 25+ age group contains an increasingly rising proportion of much older apprentices (Table 3.2A).

The Under 19 age group used to be the most numerous group until 2009/10 but since then has become the least numerous, despite the absolute figures still slightly growing. Starts for this age group have been falling significantly in proportional terms as the other two age groups increased in absolute terms in the last few years.

The 19-24 age group has also been rising in absolute terms but falling in proportional terms due to the before-mentioned huge increase in 25+ apprenticeship starts.

In Wales, apprentices aged 25+ already constituted half of total starts in 2008/09, slightly dropping only in 2011/12 (Table 3.3.). The numbers and proportion of apprentice starts among those aged 16-19 have been fairly stable while they slightly rose (absolutely and proportionately) among those aged 20-24).

⁴ Data for 2012/13 will be disaggregated into 20-24 and 25+ age groups.

In Northern Ireland, the number of starts for those aged 25+ rose enormously in absolute terms in the past six years (although a fall was recorded in 2011/12) to the point where such starts constitute the most numerous group at 56% of all starts (Table 3.4). The proportion of apprentices aged 16-19 has been falling greatly since 2007/08, both in absolute and proportional terms. The number of starts for those aged 20-24 has been rising absolutely but has been stable proportionally.

Unfortunately it is not really possible to compare Scotland to other UK countries. This is mainly due to the lack of age disaggregated data for apprentices aged 25+ but also because the 16-19 age group is different to 'Under 19' in England. It is only possible to compare 16-19 year olds in Scotland with the same age group in Wales and Northern Ireland. Here, Scotland has significantly more apprentices starting at age 16-19 than Wales and NI.

Comparing other UK countries, England and Wales are similar on the proportion of applicants aged 25+ starting apprenticeship. Northern Ireland has the highest proportion of 25+ apprentice starts at 56%. Wales was the first country where those aged 25+ became the largest group (in 2008/09).

It is worth noting that the rise in the numbers of apprentices aged 25+ show that apprenticeships, which traditionally have been a way of providing initial vocational education and training, have increasingly become a means of delivering continuing vocational education and training (see also IER, 2012). This trend may be stalled from 2013/14 in England as those aged 24+ starting at Level 3 will need to pay for their training, with loans available from the Government (Campbell et al., 2011).

Table 3.1

Number of apprenticeship starts by age at date of starting provision, Scotland

Age group	2007/08	2008/09	2009/10	2010/11	2011/12
Age 16-19	9,272 58.7%	9,053 85.6%	9,114 45.1%	12,827 59.5%	13,216 50.0%
Age 20+	6,531 41.3%	1,526 14.4%	11,102 54.9%	8,734 40.5%	13,211 50.0%
Total Starts	15,803	10,579	20,216	21,561	26,427

Source: Skills Development Scotland (personal correspondence)

Table 3.2

Number of apprenticeship starts by age at date of starting provision, England

Age group	2002/03	2003/04	2004/05	2005/06	2006/07	2007/08	2008/09	2009/10	2010/11	2011/12
Under 19	97,400	108,300	113,500	99,500	105,600	107,600	99,400	116,800	131,700	129,900

	58.1%	55.9%	60.1%	56.9%	57.2%	47.8%	41.4%	41.8%	28.8%	25.0%
Age 19-24	70,200 41.9%	85,300 44.1%	75,100 39.7%	75,200 43.0%	78,600 42.6%	90,100 40.1%	84,700 35.3%	113,800 40.7%	143,400 31.4%	161,400 31.0%
Age 25+			400 0.2%	300 0.2%	300 0.2%	27,200 12.1%	55,900 23.3%	49,100 17.6%	182,100 39.8%	229,300 44.0%
Total Starts	167,600	193,600	189,000	175,000	184,500	224,900	240,000	279,700	457,200	520,600

Source: Skills Funding Agency (personal correspondence)

Table 3.2A

Apprenticeship Starts by Narrow Age Band, England

Age group	2006/07		2007/08		2008/09		2009/10		2010/11		2011/12	
	<i>% of Total</i>		<i>% of Total</i>		<i>% of Total</i>		<i>% of Total</i>		<i>% of Total</i>		<i>% of Total</i>	
Under 16	540	*	530	*	380	*	400	*	320	*	210	*
16	33,150	18.0%	33,330	14.8%	29,550	12.3%	29,380	10.5%	30,490	6.7%	29,890	5.7%
17	35,760	19.4%	36,390	16.2%	33,010	13.8%	40,780	14.6%	44,840	9.8%	43,200	8.3%
18	36,150	19.6%	37,300	16.6%	36,420	15.2%	46,220	16.5%	56,050	12.3%	56,590	10.9%
19-24	78,560	42.6%	90,050	40.1%	84,730	35.3%	113,770	40.7%	143,430	31.4%	161,420	31.0%
25-34	220	*	13,570	6.0%	27,980	11.7%	25,250	9.0%	73,400	16.1%	97,060	18.6%
35-44	20	*	8,140	3.6%	16,670	6.9%	13,680	4.9%	54,470	11.9%	66,320	12.7%
45-59	10	*	5,220	2.3%	10,780	4.5%	9,810	3.5%	50,320	11.0%	62,200	11.9%
60+	-	-	220	*	430	*	400	*	3,890	0.9%	3,680	0.7%
Not known	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Total	184,400	100.0%	224,800	100.0%	239,900	100.0%	279,700	100.0%	457,200	100.0%	520,600	100.0%

Source: Skills Funding Agency (personal correspondence)

Table 3.3

Number of apprenticeship starts by age at date of starting provision, Wales

Age group	2008/09	2009/10	2010/11	2011/12
Age 16-19	5,790	5,025	4,875	5,090

	30.3%	28.8%	24.9%	28.4%
Age 20-24	3,670 19.2%	3,695 21.2%	4,175 21.3%	4,360 24.3%
Age 25+	9,655 50.5%	8,745 50.1%	10,565 53.9%	8,460 47.2%
Total Starts	19,115	17,465	19,615	17,910

Source: Department for Education and Skills (personal correspondence)

Table 3.4

Number of apprenticeship starts by age at date of starting provision, Northern Ireland

Age group	2006/07	2007/08	2008/09	2009/10	2010/11	2011/12
Age 16-19	2,287 69.4%	4,167 74.6%	2,745 37.2%	2,031 29.1%	1,771 18.9%	1,562 18.6%
Age 20-24	907 27.5%	1,402 25.1%	1,772 24.0%	1,490 21.4%	2,299 24.6%	2,091 24.9%

Age 25+	103 3.1%	18 0.3%	2,855 38.7%	3,452 49.5%	5,289 56.5%	4,735 56.4%
Total Starts	3,297	5,587	7,372	6,973	9,359	8,388

Source: DELNI (personal correspondence)

3.2 Level by age group

In Scotland, both 16-19 and 20+ applicants are more likely to start at Level 3+ than Level 2 (Table 3.5). Applicants aged 20+ were a small minority of starts at Level 3+ in 2008/09 but since then soared to around half of all Level 3+ starts. Starts among the 16-19 year olds have been rising absolutely at Level 2 since its introduction in 2009/10 while no clear pattern exists for 20+ at Level 2. As before, a caution needs to be issued on interpreting trends in Scotland as Level 2 was only introduced in 2009/10.

In England, all three age groups (Under 19; 19-24; 25+) are more likely to start at Level 2 than Level 3+ with Under 19s most likely to do so: around three in four aged under 19 start at Level 2, a stable trend (Table 3.6). This age group were a significant majority at Level 2 in 2005/06 but constituted less than a third of starts at this level in 2011/12 (despite the overall rise in absolute numbers). At Level 3+ absolute numbers of 16-19 year olds also rose but their relative share dropped significantly from 43% in 2005/06 to 18% in 2011/12 – this being related to the rise in starts among applicants aged 25+. The growth of starts for this age group at Level 3+ has been proportionally higher than the growth at Level 2 (although absolute growth has been higher at Level 2).

The number of starts for those aged 19-24 rose in absolute terms both at Level 2 and Level 3+ while their relative share dropped due to rise in starts among those aged 25+. 63% of applicants aged 19-24 started at Level 2 in 2011/12, a stable trend.

The number of successful applicants aged 25+ starting at Level 2 rose from 100 to 131,900 in six years to 2011/12. 57.5% of applicants aged 25+ started at Level 2 in 2011/12, a stable trend. In the latest year for which data is available (2011/12) this age group is the most numerous one at Level 2, with a similar situation at Level 3+.

In Wales, all three groups are more likely to start at Level 2 with 16-19 being most likely to do so: around 2/3 of 16-19 start at Level 2, a stable trend since 2008/09 (Table 3.7). Absolute numbers of starts for this age group have been going down slightly in the four years to 2011/12 on both levels.

Those aged 20-24 are slightly more likely to start at Level 2 than Level 3+. Starts for this age group have been growing at Level 2 but have been stable at Level 3+.

Applicants aged 25+ are also slightly more likely to start at Level 2 than Level 3+. However, absolute numbers of starts for this age group have been going up and down on both levels.

Comparing UK countries is difficult as age groups are different in Scotland and England (19 year olds fall into the 16-19 age group in Scotland but 19-24 in England; there is no specific age bracket for apprentices aged 25+ in Scotland). It is possible to say however that both age groups in Scotland (16-19; 20+) are more likely to start at Level 3+ while all three age groups in England (16-18; 19-24; 25+) and Wales (16-19; 20-24; 25+) are more likely to start at Level 2.

Table 3.5

Numbers of apprenticeship starts by level and age-group, Scotland

Level	2008/09		2009/10		2010/11		2011/12	
	16-19	20+	16-19	20+	16-19	20+	16-19	20+
Level 2	N/A	N/A	2,263	4,315	5,609	3,218	6,150	5,016
Row %	N/A	N/A	34.4%	65.6%	63.5%	36.5%	55.1%	44.9%
Column %	N/A	N/A	24.8%	38.9%	43.7%	36.8%	46.5%	38.0%
Level 3+	9,053	1,526	6,851	6,787	7,218	5,516	7,066	8,195
Row %	85.6%	14.4%	50.2%	49.8%	56.7%	43.3%	46.3%	53.7%
Column %	100.0%	100.0%	75.2%	61.1%	56.3%	63.2%	53.5%	62.0%
Total	9,053	1,526	9,114	11,102	12,827	8,734	13,216	13,211

Source: Skills Development Scotland (personal correspondence)

Table 3.6

Numbers of apprenticeship starts by level and age-group, England*

Level	2005/06			2007/08			2009/10			2011/12		
	Under 19	19-24	25+	Under 19	19-24	25+	Under 19	19-24	25+	Under 19	19-24	25+
Intermediate Level Apprenticeship	77,100	45,600	100	82,000	55,200	14,600	89,400	72,800	28,400	95,400	101,700	131,900
Row %	62.8%	37.1%	0.1%	54.0%	36.4%	9.6%	46.9%	38.2%	14.9%	29.0%	30.9%	40.1%
Column %	77.5%	60.7%	33.3%	76.3%	61.3%	53.7%	76.6%	64.0%	57.8%	73.5%	63.0%	57.5%
Advanced Level Apprenticeship and Higher Apprenticeship	22,400	29,500	200	25,520	34,820	12,600	27,300	41,000	20,700	34,400	59,700	97,400
Row %	43.0%	56.6%	0.4%	35.0%	47.7%	17.3%	31.0%	45.4%	23.5%	18.1%	30.9%	50.9%
Column %	22.5%	39.3%	66.7%	23.7%	38.7%	46.3%	23.4%	36.0%	42.2%	26.5%	37.0%	42.5%
Total	99,500	75,100	300	107,520	90,020	27,200	116,700	113,800	49,100	129,800	161,400	229,300

Source: Skills Funding Agency (personal correspondence)

*NB columns for 2006/07, 2008/09 and 2010/11 have been hidden for presentation purposes

Table 3.7

Numbers of apprenticeship starts by level and age-group, Wales

Level	2008/09			2009/10			2010/11			2011/12		
	16 - 19	20 - 24	25+	16 - 19	20 - 24	25+	16 - 19	20 - 24	25+	16 - 19	20 - 24	25+
Foundation Apprenticeship	3,805	1,940	5,255	3,235	1,915	4,390	3,310	2,275	5,620	3,280	2,495	4,430
Row %	34.6%	17.6%	47.8%	33.9%	20.1%	46.0%	29.5%	20.3%	50.2%	32.1%	24.4%	43.4%
Column %	65.7%	52.9%	54.4%	64.3%	51.9%	50.2%	67.9%	54.5%	53.2%	64.4%	57.2%	52.4%
Apprenticeship*	1,985	1,730	4,400	1,795	1,775	4,360	1,565	1,900	4,950	1,810	1,865	4,030
Row %	24.5%	21.3%	54.2%	22.6%	22.4%	55.0%	18.6%	22.6%	58.8%	23.5%	24.2%	52.3%
Column %	34.3%	47.1%	45.6%	35.7%	48.1%	49.8%	32.1%	45.5%	46.8%	35.6%	42.8%	47.6%
Total	5,790	3,670	9,655	5,030	3,690	8,750	4,875	4,175	10,570	5,090	4,360	8,460

Source: Department for Education and Skills (personal correspondence)

*including Modern Skills Diploma (2008/09 - 2010/11) and Higher Apprenticeship (2011/12)

4. Trends in participation by ethnicity

The interpretation of Scottish data on ethnicity is difficult due to a high number of apprentices not declaring their ethnicity. In terms of trends, looking at the proportion of those who self-identified as 'Non-White', diversity within MAs was stable between 2009/10-2011/12 (Table 4.1). But how well represented are ethnic minority groups? According to APS data, 96.2% of Scottish population was White in 2011/12. However, non-White ethnic groups tend to have a different age profile than the White majority. According to 2001 Census (Office of the Chief Statistician, 2004), around 17% of White Scottish population was aged 16-29, while for other ethnic groups the proportion tended to be around 25-28%. As data from Census 2011 is not available yet at the time of writing, we

need to make an assumption that these age profiles were still valid in 2011. What this means is that for age groups that use MAs most (broadly 16-29 years old), at least 3.8% are non-White.

Now, if we only take into account those apprentices who self-identified as 'Non-White' it is obvious that 'Non-White' groups are heavily underrepresented in MAs. Even if we assumed that individuals who did not answer the ethnicity question were non-White, due to the age profile issue described above we would still state that that non-White individuals are underrepresented in MAs in Scotland, although the scale of underrepresentation cannot be precisely determined.

The same Table 4.1 shows that in England diversity of MAs almost doubled between 2005/06 and 2011/12, rising from 5.5% non-White apprentices in 2005/06 to 9.9% in 2011/12 (data for earlier years is not shown in Table 4.1 for presentation purposes). However, according to Census 2011 in England, around 80% of people aged 16-34 identify themselves as White (81.7% for age 16-17; 81.8% for age 18-19; 80.4% for age 20-24; 79.5% for age 25-29; 78.9% for age 30-34). The fact that 89% of apprentices in England declare to be White indicates that non-White groups are still significantly underrepresented in MAs in England. Adding to this negative picture, according to NAS 26% of all apprenticeship applications are made by BAME individuals (Bonson, 2013) which means that the success rate is much lower for this group than for White applicants.

One reason why non-White people are heavily underrepresented in MAs seems to be that such individuals tend to be heavily concentrated in London (ONS, 2012), which has relatively fewer apprenticeship opportunities than the rest of England: London has 0.57 apprentice per 100 population compared to 0.98 for England, by far the lowest score for all English regions (North East has the highest ratio at 1.47 to 100).

In Wales there has been no change in diversity since 2008/09 (the earliest data available). As for the levels of representation, according to Census 2011 in Wales around 93% of people aged 16-34 identify themselves as White (94.6% for age 16-17; 94.2% for age 18-19; 92.5% for age 20-24; 92.8% for age 25-29; 92.5% for age 30-

34). The fact that 97% of apprentices in Wales declare themselves to be White indicates that non-White groups are significantly underrepresented in MAs in Wales.

In Northern Ireland, the levels of non-White participation were much lower in 2011/12 than in 2008/09. According to Census 2011, 1.8% of Northern Ireland's population were non-White in 2011. This figure is likely to be higher for apprenticeship-aged individuals given the younger ethnic minority population. It is however difficult to say whether at 2.1% non-White apprentices are underrepresented and if so, to what extent.

In comparison, non-White groups are underrepresented in Scotland (with lack of precision relating to the extent of this underrepresentation) and are highly underrepresented in England and Wales. Positively for England but not for the other UK countries, the level of diversity in apprenticeships in England has almost doubled since 2005/06.

Looking into the intersection of ethnicity and other equality characteristics in Scotland, data shows that male and female non-White apprentices are similarly represented (Table 4.2). With regards to age groups, it can be observed that until recently non-White apprentices aged 20+ were better represented in MAs than 16-19 year olds (Table 4.3). It seems that one of the ways of popularising MAs among non-White young people aged 16-19 would be to better advertise MAs with secondary schools in highly diverse areas.

Turning to patterns regarding ethnicity and sector framework in Scotland, it can be observed that three frameworks have recently become more diverse while two less diverse (Table 4.4). Construction is an interesting case with 10% more non-white apprentices in 2011/12 than in the previous year. Caution needs to be exercised when interpreting minority ethnic participation in frameworks as numbers are small.

Similarly, caution needs to be exercised with regards to Scottish data on ethnicity and level, which is due to the fact that Level 2 was introduced relatively recently. Looking at available data on individuals who self-identified as

‘Non-White’, it can be said that Level 2 is more diverse than Level 3+, or in other words that non-White groups are more underrepresented at Level 3+ than at Level 2 (Table 4.5). However, there is no clear pattern for ‘White’ apprentices and the rate of no response is high, making the interpretation of evidence less clear-cut.

Table 4.1

Apprenticeship starts by ethnicity

Country	2008/09			2009/10			2010/11			2011/12		
	White	Non White	Not Known	White	Non White	Not Known	White	Non White	Not Known	White	Non White	Not Known
Scotland	98.2%	0.7%	1.1%	95.6%	1.6%	2.8%	96.3%	1.3%	2.4%	95.9%	1.7%	2.4%
England	90.8%	8.2%	1.0%	91.1%	8.0%	1.0%	89.0%	10.0%	1.0%	89.3%	9.9%	0.8%
Wales	96.7%	2.3%	0.9%	96.7%	2.4%	0.9%	96.4%	2.9%	0.7%	96.9%	2.6%	0.5%
NI	91.0%	3.4%	5.6%	97.0%	2.1%	0.9%	97.7%	2.3%	0.0%	97.9%	2.1%	0.0%

Source: Skills Development Scotland, Skills Funding Agency, Department for Education and Skills, DELNI (personal correspondence)

Table 4.2

Apprenticeship starts by ethnicity and gender, Scotland

Gender	2008/09	2009/10	2010/11	2011/12

	White	Non White	Not Known	White	Non White	Not Known	White	Non White	Not Known	White	Non White	Not Known
Male	98.5%	0.7%	0.8%	96.7%	1.6%	1.8%	96.4%	1.3%	2.2%	95.3%	1.6%	3.1%
Female	97.4%	0.6%	2.0%	94.0%	1.7%	4.2%	96.1%	1.3%	2.6%	96.7%	1.8%	1.5%
Total	98.2%	0.7%	1.1%	95.6%	1.6%	2.8%	96.3%	1.3%	2.4%	95.9%	1.7%	2.4%

Source: Skills Development Scotland (personal correspondence)

Table 4.3

Apprenticeship starts by ethnicity and age group, Scotland

Age group	2008/09			2009/10			2010/11			2011/12		
	White	Non White	Not Known	White	Non White	Not Known	White	Non White	Not Known	White	Non White	Not Known
16-19	8,890 98.2%	56 0.6%	107 1.2%	8,923 97.9%	71 0.8%	120 1.3%	12,555 97.9%	83 0.6%	189 1.5%	12,759 96.5%	147 1.1%	310 2.3%
20+	1,500 98.3%	15 1.0%	11 0.7%	9,719 96.5%	174 1.7%	176 1.7%	11,923 97.5%	185 1.5%	126 1.0%	8,226 95.7%	86 1.0%	280 3.3%
Total	10,390 98.2%	71 0.7%	118 1.1%	18,642 95.6%	245 1.6%	296 2.8%	24,478 96.3%	268 1.3%	315 2.4%	20,985 95.9%	233 1.7%	590 2.4%

Source: Skills Development Scotland (personal correspondence)

Table 4.4

MA Starts by framework and ethnicity, Scotland

(sorted by 2011/12, minimum 500 apprentices, descending)

MA Framework	2008/09		2009/10		2010/11		2011/12	
	Total	White	Total	White	Total	White	Total	White
Hospitality	337	99.7%	2,018	96.8%	2,511	97.8%	3,520	96.8%
Construction	2,366	98.4%	2,231	97.3%	2,046	97.6%	2,373	87.2%
Retail	267	99.6%	1,982	97.2%	1,799	97.6%	1,952	98.2%
Health and Social Care	75	90.7%	2,339	86.2%	1,314	94.8%	1,926	96.5%
Business & Administration	973	98.6%	908	98.0%	1,731	97.9%	1,797	97.4%
Management	51	100.0%	918	96.3%	1,250	94.1%	1,703	96.3%
Customer Service	458	96.5%	2,018	89.2%	2,254	90.5%	1,465	90.1%
Food Manufacture	8	100.0%	598	99.5%	628	98.2%	1,308	96.9%
Engineering	1,340	98.3%	1,038	99.6%	943	99.7%	1,209	98.9%
Early Years Care and Education	650	93.1%	942	95.2%	993	96.0%	1,165	94.8%

Hairdressing	238	99.2%	547	99.1%	1,340	99.4%	1,157	98.7%
Driving Goods Vehicles	39	100.0%	1,233	99.7%	681	98.2%	1,145	99.7%
Automotive	0	N/A	0	N/A	0	N/A	850	98.8%

Source: Skills Development Scotland (personal correspondence)

Table 4.5

MA starts by ethnicity and level, Scotland

Level	2008/09			2009/10			2010/11			2011/12		
	White	Non White	Not Known*	White	Non White	Not Known*	White	Non White	Not Known*	White	Non White	Not Known*
L2	N/A	N/A	N/A	6,100 92.7%	172 2.6%	306 4.7%	8,457 95.8%	163 1.8%	207 2.3%	10,858 97.2%	217 1.9%	91 0.8%
L3+	10,390 98.3%	71 1.0%	118 0.7%	13,218 96.9%	160 1.2%	260 1.9%	12,298 96.6%	125 1.0%	311 2.4%	14,489 94.9%	225 1.5%	547 3.6%
Total	10,390 98.2%	71 0.7%	118 1.1%	19,318 95.6%	332 1.6%	566 2.8%	20,755 96.3%	288 1.3%	518 2.4%	25,347 95.9%	442 1.7%	638 2.4%

Source: Skills Development Scotland (personal correspondence)

*Including 'Prefer not to say'

5. Trends in participation by Learning Difficulty and/or Disability (LDD)

Data for Scotland shows that participation of individuals with LDD in MAs is startlingly low in comparison with the general population (Table 5.1). In 2011/12 only 0.3% of new apprentices declared having a disability or learning difficulty, while the proportion of 16-24 year olds reporting a limiting long-term illness or disability was around 8%, rising to 14% for 25-34 year olds (data for 2008; see Allmark, Salway, & Piercy, 2010). Adding to this negative picture, the proportion of apprentices with LDD has been falling since 2008/09.

It needs to be remembered, however, that as with 'ethnicity' analysing participation in MAs by disability or learning difficulty is hindered by the fact that some apprentices may not want to declare having a condition. Others may also do not consider their condition to be a 'disability' or 'learning difficulty'. Furthermore, for some individuals in the general population the disability or learning difficulty may be too severe to allow for taking up employment and training in the form of an apprenticeship. Other barriers to taking up an apprenticeship such as not having required entry qualifications or living in an area where few or none apprenticeships are offered may also affect young people with LDD more than those who do not have a disability/LD. Still, it seems very unlikely that these factors on their own are responsible for such a wide gap, and therefore it can be claimed that individuals with a disability or learning difficulty are underrepresented in MAs.

In England 7.7% of new apprentices declared having a disability or learning difficulty in 2011/12 (Table 5.1). While this is much better than in Scotland, this is still not representative of the general population: the proportion of 16-24 year olds reporting a limiting long-term illness or disability is around 9% rising to 11% for 25-34 year olds (data for 2008; see Allmark et al., 2010). Furthermore, the proportion of new apprentices with LDD has been falling since 2008/09.

In Wales the proportion of new apprentices with disability/LD has been stable since 2008/09. At 3.1% in 2011/12, new apprentices with LDD seem to be underrepresented: the proportion of 16-24 year olds reporting a

limiting long-term illness or disability is around 7% rising to 10% for 25-34 year olds (data for 2008; see Allmark et al., 2010).

In Northern Ireland the proportion of apprentices with disability/LD has been stable since 2008/09.

Overall, it is obvious that none of the UK countries is doing well in the area of disability and learning difficulties. England seems to be faring least badly while Scotland seems to be doing very poorly. To add to this bad news for Scotland, the proportion of apprentices with LDD has been falling since 2008/09.

Looking more in-depth into the intersection of LDD and other equality characteristics, data for Scotland shows that until recently there were significantly fewer female apprentices with LDD than male apprentices (Table 5.2). This is of concern as there are proportionally more women than men reporting a limiting long-term illness or disability: for 16-24 year olds the rate is 6% for men and 10% for women; for 25-34 year olds the rate is 11% for men and 17% for women (data for 2008; see Allmark, Salway, & Piercy, 2010).

As previously, caution needs to be exercised with regards to Scottish data on ethnicity and level, which is due to the fact that Level 2 was introduced relatively recently. Looking at available data on individuals who declared having LDD, it can be seen that in absolute terms there are slightly more people with LDD on Level 3+ than on Level 2, but proportionally apprentices with LDD are less represented at Level 3+ (Table 5.6). A recent fall in Level 3+ starts among new apprentices with LDD is responsible for the total fall in LDD figures.

Table 5.1

Apprenticeship starts by disability/learning difficulty

Country	2008/09	2009/10	2010/11	2011/12
---------	---------	---------	---------	---------

	No disability or LD	Disability or LD	Not known	No disability or LD	Disability or LD	Not known	No disability or LD	Disability or LD	Not known	No disability or LD	Disability or LD	Not known
Scotland	99.3%	0.7%		99.6%	0.4%		99.7%	0.3%		99.7%	0.3%	
England	89.4%	9.9%	0.7%	89.6%	9.4%	0.9%	91.2%	8.0%	0.8%	91.0%	7.7%	1.3%
Wales	96.8%	3.2%		96.7%	3.3%		96.8%	3.2%		96.9%	3.1%	
NI	98.2%	1.8%		98.5%	1.5%		98.7%	1.3%		98.2%	1.8%	

Source: Skills Development Scotland, Skills Funding Agency, Department for Education and Skills, DELNI (personal correspondence)

Table 5.2

Apprenticeship starts by gender and disability, Scotland

Disability	2008/09		2009/10		2010/11		2011/12	
	Male	Female	Male	Female	Male	Female	Male	Female
No	7,649	2,855	11,680	8,448	11,863	9,638	15,006	11,347
% No	99.1%	99.8%	99.5%	99.7%	99.6%	99.8%	99.7%	99.7%
Yes	68	7	63	25	42	18	40	34
% Yes	0.9%	0.2%	0.5%	0.3%	0.4%	0.2%	0.3%	0.3%

Total	7,717	2,862	11,743	8,473	11,905	9,656	15,046	11,381
--------------	-------	-------	--------	-------	--------	-------	--------	--------

Source: Skills Development Scotland (personal correspondence)

Table 5.3

Numbers of apprenticeship starts by level and disability status, Scotland

Disability	2009/10		2010/11		2011/12	
	Level 2	Level 3+	Level 2	Level 3+	Level 2	Level 3+
No	6,543	13,585	8,800	12,701	11,130	15,223
% No	99.5%	99.6%	99.7%	99.7%	99.7%	99.8%
Yes	35	53	27	33	36	38
% Yes	0.5%	0.4%	0.3%	0.3%	0.3%	0.2%
Total	6,578	13,638	8,827	12,734	11,166	15,261

Source: Skills Development Scotland (personal correspondence)

6. Trends in participation by faith/belief

Northern Ireland is the only UK country that collects data on faith/belief.

Interpreting the data in Table 7.1 is difficult for two reasons. Firstly, the volume of 'not known' cases is so high that investigating the column % is not really productive. Secondly, categories used in this table are not exactly the same as categories used in Census 2011; in particular, the Census used a 'Protestant *and other Christian-related*' category while DELNI uses the 'Protestant' category.

The only way to carry out an analysis is to (1) assume that non-response is proportionally spread, and (2) to focus on new apprentices who declared to be 'Catholic'. In Census 2011, 49.6% of those aged 16-34 declared to be Catholic. If we exclude the 'Not known' responses in table 7.1, Catholic apprentices represented 47.5% of all apprentices in 2011/12, which is slightly below, but not far off the 49.6% figure from Census 2011. Therefore we can cautiously say that Catholic people are fairly represented in MAs in Northern Ireland.

Table 6.1

Apprenticeship starts by faith, Northern Ireland

Faith	2006/07	2007/08	2008/09	2009/10	2010/11	2011/12
-------	---------	---------	---------	---------	---------	---------

Catholic	1,072 32.5%	2,036 36.4%	2,373 32.2%	2,753 39.5%	3,682 39.3%	3,151 37.6%
Protestant	814 24.7%	1,771 31.7%	2,258 30.6%	2,354 33.8%	3,424 36.6%	3,121 37.2%
Other	61 1.9%	108 1.9%	843 11.4%	392 5.6%	410 4.4%	352 4.2%
Not Known	1,350 40.9%	1,672 29.9%	1,898 25.7%	1,474 21.1%	1,843 19.7%	1,764 21.0%
Total Starts	3,297	5,587	7,372	6,973	9,359	8,388

Source: DELNI (personal correspondence)

7. Gaps in data

Of all UK countries, Scotland has got the most in-depth equality data on Modern Apprenticeships. However, no data is being collected on apprentices' sexual orientation and faith/belief. Having data on faith/belief may be particularly useful considering evidence on labour market discrimination of Irish Catholics in the West of Scotland (Netto et al., 2011).

With regards to equality data for England, the researchers had to limit their data requests due to exceeding the appropriate cost limit for handling a request under the Freedom of Information Act. Of the data held by SFA but not provided to the researchers for the above-mentioned reason, the most potentially useful data regards the characteristics of successful and unsuccessful applicants. The only readily available piece of statistical information on applications regards the ethnicity of applicants and is presented in section 4 of this report.

The analysis would benefit from having data on ethnicity by gender/age/level/sector framework as well as data on LDD by gender/age/level/sector framework. Similarly to the other UK countries, data on apprentices' sexual orientation is not being collected in England. Information on spend by framework and level is not being collected by the SFA.

Regional English data broken down by ethnicity/LDD is available for 2011/12 only, which renders the analysis of trends impossible and creates a risk of misinterpreting the reality if 2011/12 happened to be an unusual year (the situation which has been sporadically encountered in this review).

Due to the data requests exceeding the appropriate cost limit for handling a request under the Freedom of Information Act, this review could not make use of all equality in apprenticeships data held by the Welsh Government. Specifically, in the future it would be useful to include in the analysis data on:

- sector framework by gender and level *combined* (this would allow for finding out whether proportionally more women than men start at less valuable Level 2);
- spend by framework and level (however, the Welsh Government does not collect data on the latter);
- ethnicity by gender/age/level;
- sector framework by ethnicity (however, only high-level ethnicity data would be useful as otherwise numbers would be very small);
- LDD by gender/age/level/sector framework.

Similarly to Scotland and England, the Welsh Government is not collecting data on apprentices' sexual orientation and faith/belief.

Of all UK countries, Northern Ireland has the weakest equality data on apprenticeships. Many kinds of data are not available due to 'limitations as to what is available by way of management information' (DELNI, personal communication). Specifically, the data that would be useful from an equalities perspective but has not been provided to the researchers include: total apprenticeships starts by programme level (2/3); programme level by age/gender/ethnicity/LDD; sector framework by gender/ethnicity/LDD; and spend by sector framework. Data on spend by level has been provided but due to the lack of other equalities data turned out to be of no use for this review. Similarly to the other UK countries, data on apprentices' sexual orientation is not being collected in Northern Ireland. While data on faith/belief is being collected, it would be helpful to align categories that are used with the Census 2011 categories.

8. Conclusion

Modern Apprenticeships play an important role in enabling individuals to build up skills, experiences and work experience, providing structured routes into employment in England, Wales and Northern Ireland. In Scotland, the programme offers valuable opportunities for those already in employment to take up training. Recent qualitative research in Scotland and England has also revealed that they enable individuals, including those from ethnic minority groups, to translate their educational qualifications into employment opportunities (Hudson et al., forthcoming). They also offer benefits to employers in cutting down the costs associated with recruitment and training of new staff, and provide them an opportunity to fill skills gaps, thus supporting economic growth. The imperative that Modern Apprenticeships should be used to good effect for all sections of the population is sharpened by the fall in the share of jobs requiring only low level skills from 60 to 40 per cent in the last 15 years. It is predicted to decline to 32 per cent by 2020 (Cambridge Econometrics/Warwick Institute for Education research, cited in CBI, 2010).

It is thus encouraging to note that since Modern Apprenticeships were first implemented in 1995, the number of new starts to the scheme has increased in all four UK countries, indicating that experience of the scheme has been positive for both apprentices and employers. This report also highlights that differences in the make-up of modern apprentices in each country, with more younger and Level 3 starts in Scotland.

However, this study clearly shows that participation in apprenticeships continues to reflect inequalities on the basis of gender, ethnicity and disability/learning difficulty revealed by previous analyses (see section 1.3) as well as broader patterns in the labour market. To some extent, this is perhaps not surprising given the influence of societal stereotyping and prejudice. However, the persistence of these trends thirteen years after Modern Apprenticeships were first established is a powerful reminder that unless corrective action is taken, apprenticeships are likely to continue to reproduce and reinforce current inequalities in the labour market. Since the implementation of apprenticeships is a devolved responsibility, there is much that Scottish Government can do to ensure

that a more diverse population benefits from participation in such skills. Equality proofing apprenticeships also helps to fill skills shortages and support economic growth, since those frameworks in which women and ethnic minorities are under-represented are those where there are skills shortages.

In order to redress current trends in terms of starts, entry levels, frameworks and investment per individual, more attention needs to be paid to examining processes related to the take-up of apprenticeships by all sections of the population, including how apprenticeships are publicised. Scotland is the only country in which the number of female starts continues to be lower than male starts. Trends in the other three countries indicate that gendered trends can be altered, and there is scope to learn from good practice. In terms of ethnicity, the persistent under-representation of ethnic minorities in apprenticeships in England, Wales and Scotland indicates that none of these countries is taking sufficient action to redress current inequalities, including among those groups which suffer from persistently high unemployment rates and levels of poverty (Netto et al., 2011). Similarly, the low numbers of individuals with LDD participating in apprenticeships indicates the need for awareness-raising among potential employers and individuals with LDD. Cumulatively, these findings indicate that employers involved in apprenticeships should be reminded of the role that they can play in promoting and supporting more diverse workforces. Public sector employers participating in the scheme should be made aware that their obligations under the Equality and Human Rights Act and the new Public Sector Equality Duties extend to Modern Apprenticeships.

In addition to increasing levels of representation among women, ethnic minorities and people with LDD in Modern Apprenticeships in Scotland, more attention can be paid to publicising the range of organisations and organisational activities available in order to widen career choices through schools' careers services and Job Centres. Similarly, there is scope for more work to be undertaken to ensure that more individuals from the three equality groups are recruited into more expensive Level 3 apprenticeships and routes into higher education and professional training with their associated longer term returns. This would also help current levels of investment per individual - closely associated with entry

levels and frameworks of participation - are more evenly spread among diverse sections of the population. More targeted action in terms of publicising the availability of apprenticeships would also encourage women and ethnic minorities to consider non-traditional sectors of employment, thus ensuring a wider representation of these groups in the Scottish workforce, and redressing both gender and ethnic occupational segregation.

In terms of age, it is worth noting the positive trend of higher Level 3 than Level 2 starts among 16 – 19 year olds and those aged 20+ in Scotland. The increasing take up of apprenticeships by those aged above 25 in Northern Ireland, England and Wales suggests that this pattern is likely to hold in Scotland too. While the current climate of recession and austerity, involving organisational restructuring, jobs losses and cuts to public services is likely to have played a major role in this, qualitative research in England and Scotland has revealed that older apprentices also benefit from wider career options on completion of the apprenticeship, enabling them to build on and broaden the range of their skills and experiences (Hudson et al., forthcoming). Finally, it should be noted that data on the monitoring of apprenticeships by religion and sexual orientation would also be useful.

Recommendations

Scottish Government should adopt a strategic approach to Modern Apprenticeships which seeks to:

- Increase the diversity of individuals participating in apprenticeships among the population, including among women, ethnic minorities and people with a disability/learning difficulty
- Widen the range of industries, sectors and organisations in which the three equality groups are represented
- In order to achieve this, Scottish Government/Skills Development Scotland should remind public sector organisations which are participating in the programme of their duties under the Equalities and Human Rights Act to promote a diverse workforce, including by collecting and reviewing equality data on those participating in apprenticeship programmes, and taking appropriate action.

- Scottish Government/Skills Development Scotland should encourage private sector employers who are participating in the programme to collect and review equality data relating to those participating in the apprenticeship programmes
- Where apprenticeships are advertised (as in the case of the Commonwealth Apprenticeship Initiative), the SG should encourage employers to increase the diversity of recruits through positive action. This could take a form of targeted action to publicise apprenticeships, for instance through outreach work in areas densely populated by ethnic minorities

Employers can take positive action to promote more diverse workforces by:

- Encouraging women to take up apprenticeships in non-traditional activities, for instance through supporting family friendly policies
- By working with community organisations to encourage other equality groups to take up apprenticeships

9. References

- Allmark, P., Salway, S., & Piercy, H. (2010). *LIFE & HEALTH: An evidence review and synthesis for the Equality and Human Rights Commission's Triennial Review 2010*. Sheffield: Centre for Health & Social Care Research, Sheffield Hallam University. Retrieved from http://www.equalityhumanrights.com/uploaded_files/triennial_review/triennial_review_life_health_omnibus.pdf
- Beck, V., Fuller, A., & Unwin, L. (2006). Safety in stereotypes? The impact of gender and 'race' on young people's perceptions of their

post-compulsory education and labour market opportunities. *British Educational Research Journal*, 32(5), 667–686.

doi:10.1080/01411920600895718

BIS. (2010). *Investing in Skills for Sustainable Growth*. London: Department for Business, Innovation and Skills.

Bonson, C. (2013). *The role of apprenticeships in increasing ethnic minority employment*. Presented at the 'How do we increase ethnic minority employment?' conference organised by CESI and BTEG, London. Retrieved from http://stats.cesi.org.uk/events_presentations/BTEG/Plenary%201315%20BonsonC.pptx

Campbell, J., Thomson, E., & Pautz, H. (2011). Apprenticeship Training in England: Closing the Gap? *Journal of Contemporary European Studies*, 19(3), 365–378. doi:10.1080/14782804.2011.610606

CBI. (2010). *Making it all add up: business priorities for numeracy and maths*. London: Confederation of British Industry (CBI). Retrieved from <http://www.cbi.org.uk/media/935352/2010.08-making-it-all-add-up.pdf>

Fuller, A., Beck, V., & Unwin, L. (2005). The gendered nature of apprenticeship: Employers' and young people's perspectives. *Education + Training*, 47(4/5), 298–311.

doi:10.1108/00400910510601887

Fuller, A., & Davey, G. (2010). *EHRC Triennial Review: Equality Groups and Apprenticeship*. Southampton: School of Education, University of Southampton.

Hudson, M., Netto, G., Sosenko, F., Noon, M., De Lima, P., Gilchrist, A., & Kamenou-Aigbekaen, N. (forthcoming). *Low income households, ethnicity and workplace cultures*. York: Joseph Rowntree Foundation.

IER. (2012). *Review of Apprenticeships Research*. Coventry: Institute for Employment Research (IER), University of Warwick. Retrieved from www.apprenticeships.org.uk%2FAbout-Us%2F~%2Fmedia%2FDocuments%2FIER-Apprenticeships-Literature-Review-final-July-2012.ashx&ei=mvW6Uey6MoGm0QWu2ICQCw&usg=AFQjCNHZtxX9OSTI9FuREh9V20AyTc-NSQ&sig2=Yh6wnkkATwaP-RpOOybukw&bvm=bv.47883778,d.d2k

Little, P. (2012). *Creating an inclusive Apprenticeship Offer*. The Apprenticeship Unit.

Miller, L. (2005). Addressing gender segregation in apprenticeships in England. *Education + Training*, 47(4/5), 283–297.
doi:10.1108/00400910510601878

NAS. (2009). *Diversity in Apprenticeships - Prospectus*. London: National Apprenticeship Service.

- Netto, G., Sosenko, F., & Bramley, G. (2011). *Poverty and Ethnicity in Scotland: Review of the Literature and Datasets*. York: Joseph Rowntree Foundation. Retrieved from <http://www.jrf.org.uk/sites/files/jrf/poverty-ethnicity-Scotland-full.pdf>
- Newton, B., Miller, L., Oakley, J., & Hicks, B. (2012). *Good Practice Evaluation of the Diversity in Apprenticeships Pilots*. Brighton: Institute for Employment Studies. Retrieved from http://www.apprenticeships.org.uk/Partners/Policy/~/_media/Documents/NASEvaluationofDiAPilotsFinalReport%202.ashx
- O'Toole, R. (2011). *Apprenticeships in Wales and the UK*. Cardiff: National Assembly for Wales.
- Office of the Chief Statistician. (2004). *Analysis of Ethnicity in the 2001 Census – Summary Report*. Edinburgh: The Scottish Executive. Retrieved from <http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Publications/2004/02/18876/32917>
- ONS. (2012). *Ethnicity and National Identity in England and Wales 2011*. Office for National Statistics.
- Richard, D. (2012). *The Richard Review of Apprenticeships*. London: School for Startups.
- Robertson, A. (2010). *National Training Programmes: Equality Impact Assessment & Action Plan*. Glasgow: Skills Development Scotland.

Thomson, E., McKay, A., Campbell, J., & Gillespie, M. (2005). *Jobs for the boys and the girls: promoting a smart, successful and equal Scotland*. Glasgow: Equal Opportunities Commission. Retrieved from

http://www.closesthegap.org.uk/component/option,com_docman/Itemid,64/gid,79/task,doc_download/

Unwin, L., & Wellington, J. J. (2001). *Young people's perspectives on education, training and employment: realizing their potential*. London: Kogan Page.